

Which magnetic fields support a zero mode?

Michael Loss
School of Mathematics
Georgia Institute of Technology



May 7, 2021

Joint work with

Rupert Frank

Remembrance of things past

Hydrogenic Atom in a magnetic field

$$H_d = (-i\nabla - A(x))^2 - \frac{Z}{|x|}$$

acts on wavefunctions $\psi(x) \in \mathbb{C}$

$$B(x) = \text{curl}A(x)$$

Denote the ground state energy by $E_d(Z, B)$

Kato's Diamagnetic inequality

$$|(-i\nabla - A(x))\psi(x)|^2 \geq |\nabla|\psi(x)||^2$$

$E_d(Z, B) \geq E_d(Z, 0)$, gauge invariance!

Diamagnetism

This is not the whole truth: **Electrons carry spin**
Hydrogenic atom in a magnetic field

$$H = (-i\nabla - A(x))^2 - \sigma \cdot B(x) - \frac{Z}{|x|}$$

Pauli operator acts on **spinors**

$$\psi = \begin{pmatrix} \psi_1 \\ \psi_2 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \psi_1, \psi_2 \in \mathbb{C}, \quad \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\psi_1|^2 + |\psi_2|^2 dx = 1$$

$$B = \text{curl}A, \quad \sigma \cdot B = \begin{pmatrix} B_3 & B_1 - iB_2 \\ B_1 + iB_2 & -B_3 \end{pmatrix}$$

For B large

$$E(Z, B) = \inf_{\|\psi\|=1} (\psi, H\psi) \rightarrow -\infty$$

The Hamiltonian is gauge invariant and ground state energy depends on B
Paramagnetism

The ground state energy should be compensated by the field energy

$$\mathcal{E}(\psi, A) = \|\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A)\psi\|^2 - Z \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \frac{|\psi|^2}{|x|} dx + \frac{1}{8\pi\alpha^2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |B(x)|^2 dx .$$

$$\alpha = \frac{e^2}{\hbar c} \approx \frac{1}{137} , \text{Sommerfeld Fine Structure Constant}$$

$$[\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A(x))]^2 = (-i\nabla - A(x))^2 - \sigma \cdot B(x)$$

$$E(Z) = \inf_B \{E(Z, B) + \frac{1}{8\pi\alpha^2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |B(x)|^2 dx\} = \inf_{\psi, A} \mathcal{E}(\psi, A) > -\infty ?$$

Zero Modes

$$\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A(x))\psi(x) = 0 \quad (1)$$

$$\sigma_1 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \sigma_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & -i \\ i & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \sigma_3 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & -1 \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A(x)) \\ = & \begin{pmatrix} -i\partial_3 - A_3 & -i\partial_1 - \partial_2 - (A_1 - iA_2) \\ -i\partial_1 + \partial_2 - (A_1 + iA_2) & +i\partial_3 + A_3 \end{pmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

$$\psi = \begin{pmatrix} \psi_1 \\ \psi_2 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \psi_1, \psi_2 \in \mathbb{C}, \quad \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\psi_1|^2 + |\psi_2|^2 dx = 1$$

$$B = \text{curl}A \in L^2(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{R}^3)$$

$$\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A(x))\psi(x) = 0$$

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\psi|^2 dx = 1, \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |B(x)|^2 dx < \infty$$

$$A_\lambda(x) = \lambda A(\lambda x), \psi_\lambda(x) = \lambda^{3/2} \psi(\lambda x)$$

$$\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A_\lambda(x))\psi_\lambda(x) = 0$$

$$\mathcal{E}(\psi_\lambda, A_\lambda) = \lambda(-Z \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \frac{|\psi|^2}{|x|} dx + \frac{1}{8\pi\alpha^2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |B(x)|^2 dx)$$

Hydrogen is unstable if and only if there is a zero mode
(Fröhlich, Lieb, Loss 1986)

Zero modes (Loss-Yau, 1986)

$$\psi = \frac{1 + i\sigma \cdot x}{(1 + |x|^2)^{3/2}} \phi, \phi \text{ a constant spinor} \quad (2)$$

$$A(x) = \frac{3}{(1 + |x|^2)^2} ((1 - |x|^2)\omega + 2(\omega \cdot x)x + 2\omega \wedge x)$$

$$\omega = \langle \phi, \sigma \phi \rangle .$$

$$\langle \phi, \psi \rangle = \bar{\phi}_1 \psi_1 + \bar{\phi}_2 \psi_2, \text{ inner product on } \mathbb{C}^2$$

Field lines are pull back of the Hopf fibration on \mathbb{S}^3
under stereographic projection

Sobolev's inequality

$$f : \mathbb{R}^d \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$$

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^d} |\nabla f(x)|^2 dx \geq S \left(\int_{\mathbb{R}^d} |f(x)|^p dx \right)^{2/p}$$

$$p = \frac{2d}{d-2},$$

$$S_d = \frac{d(d-2)}{4} |\mathbb{S}^d|^{2/d},$$

and there is equality if and only if up to translations

$$f(x) = \left(c_* \lambda + \frac{|x|^2}{\lambda} \right)^{-(d-2)/2}, \lambda > 0$$

Rodemich (1966), Talenti (1976), Aubin (1975)

Measure of a potential supporting a bound state with negative energy

$$-\Delta - V(x), V(x) \geq 0, V(x) \rightarrow 0 \text{ as } |x| \rightarrow \infty.$$

If one seeks this measure in terms of an L^p norm of the potential, the only possibility is

$$\|V\|_{3/2}, \text{ scaling } V(x) \rightarrow \lambda^2 V(\lambda x)$$

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\nabla f|^2 dx - \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} V|f|^2 dx \geq \|f\|_6^2 (S_3 - \|V\|_{3/2})$$

Necessary condition for a bound state is that $\|V\|_{3/2} > S_3$.

This condition is sharp!

A **simple** necessary condition for zero modes:

$$\sigma(-i\nabla - A)\psi = 0 \Rightarrow [\sigma(-i\nabla - A)]^2\psi = (-i\nabla - A)^2\psi - \sigma \cdot B\psi = 0$$

$$\|(-i\nabla - A)\psi\|_2^2 = \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} B(x) \cdot \langle \psi, \sigma\psi \rangle(x) dx \leq \|B\|_{3/2} \|\psi\|_6^2$$

$$|\langle \psi, \sigma\psi \rangle| = |\psi|^2 = \sqrt{\langle \psi, \psi \rangle}$$

by the diamagnetic inequality

$$\|(-i\nabla - A)\psi\|_2^2 \geq \|\nabla|\psi|\|_2^2$$

hence a necessary condition for a zero mode is

$$\|B\|_{3/2} \geq S_3$$

We may assume that $A \in L^3(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{R}^3)$.

$$A(x) = \text{const.} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \frac{x-y}{|x-y|^3} \wedge B(x) dx$$

satisfies

$$\text{curl} A = B, \text{div} A = 0$$

The estimate follows from the Hardy-Littlewood-Sobolev inequality

$$\left\| \frac{1}{|x|^\lambda} \star f \right\|_p \leq C_{p,d} \|f\|_q, \quad \frac{1}{q} + \frac{\lambda}{d} = 1 + \frac{1}{p}$$

Theorem

Fix $3/2 < p < \infty$ and let $\psi \in L^p(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{C}^2)$ be a solution of the zero mode equation (1). Then $\psi \in L^r(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{C}^2)$ for any $3/2 < r < \infty$.

A not so simple improvement

$$\begin{aligned}\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A(x))\psi(x) &= 0, A \in L^3(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{R}^3), \\ B = \operatorname{curl}A &\in L^{3/2}(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{R}^3).\end{aligned}\tag{3}$$

Theorem

Let $B \in L^{3/2}(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{R}^3)$ be a magnetic field, i.e., $\operatorname{div} B = 0$. A necessary condition for (3) to have a weak solution $0 \neq \psi \in L^p(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{C}^2)$ for some $3/2 < p < \infty$ is that

$$\|B\|_{3/2} \geq 2S_3.$$

Absence of eigenvalues for the Pauli-Operator is a difficult problem
Cossetti, Fanelli, and Krejčířík (2020)

Diamagnetic inequality

$$\psi = e^{iS}|\psi|$$

$$\begin{aligned} |(-i\nabla - A(x))\psi(x)|^2 &= |\nabla|\psi||^2 + |\nabla S(x) - A(x)|^2|\psi|^2 \\ &\geq |\nabla|\psi||^2 . \end{aligned}$$

Has interesting consequences

$$|(-i\nabla - A(x))^{-2}(x, y)| \leq \frac{1}{4\pi|x - y|}$$

Lemma

Let $\psi \in L^p(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{C}^2)$, $p > 3/2$ satisfy $\sigma \cdot (-i\nabla - A)\psi = 0$. Then $\psi \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{C}^2)$, and $|\psi| \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^3)$ as well and moreover, almost everywhere in \mathbb{R}^3 ,

$$|\nabla|\psi||^2 \leq \frac{2}{3} |(-i\nabla - A)\psi|^2 .$$

David M. J. Calderbank, Paul Gauduchon, and Marc Herzlich (2000)

Paul M. N. Feehan (2001)

Kato-Yau inequality

Elias Stein

An algebraic fact

$v \in \mathbb{C}^2$, spinor, $\beta = (\beta_1, \beta_2, \beta_3) \in \mathbb{R}^3$.

$$(\Pi(\beta \otimes v))_j = \beta_j v - \frac{1}{3} \sigma_j \sigma \cdot \beta v \quad \text{for } j = 1, 2, 3.$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^3 \sigma_j (\Pi(\beta \otimes v))_j = 0, \sigma_j^2 = I, j = 1, 2, 3$$

$$(\beta \otimes v, \gamma \otimes w) = \sum_j \beta_j \gamma_j \langle v, w \rangle$$

$$(\Pi(\beta \otimes v), \gamma \otimes w) = (\beta \otimes v, \Pi(\gamma \otimes w))$$

$$|\Pi(\beta \otimes v)|^2 = \frac{2}{3} |\beta|^2 |v|^2.$$

$$|\psi|_\varepsilon = \sqrt{|\psi|^2 + \varepsilon^2}$$

$$\partial_j |\psi|_\varepsilon = \operatorname{Re} \left\langle \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, \partial_j \psi \right\rangle = \operatorname{Re} \left\langle \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, (\partial_j - iA_j) \psi \right\rangle$$

$$|\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon| = \frac{\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon}{|\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon|} \cdot \nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon = \operatorname{Re} \left\langle \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon} \frac{\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon}{|\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon|}, (\nabla - iA) \psi \right\rangle. \quad (4)$$

$$(\nabla - iA)_j \psi = (\nabla - iA)_j \psi - \frac{1}{3} \sigma_j \sigma \cdot (\nabla - iA) \psi = [\Pi (\nabla - iA) \psi]_j,$$

$$|\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon| = \operatorname{Re} \left\langle \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon} \frac{\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon}{|\nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon|}, \Pi (\nabla - iA) \psi \right\rangle.$$

$$|\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon| = \operatorname{Re} \left\langle \Pi \left(\frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon} \frac{\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon}{|\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon|} \right), (\nabla - i\mathbf{A})\psi \right\rangle .$$

$$|\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon| \leq \left| \Pi \left(\frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon} \frac{\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon}{|\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon|} \right) \right| |(\nabla - i\mathbf{A})\psi| .$$

$$|\Pi(\beta \otimes \nu)|^2 = \frac{2}{3} |\beta|^2 |\nu|^2 .$$

$$\nu = \psi / |\psi|_\varepsilon$$

$$\beta = \nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon / |\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon|$$

ε tend to zero yields the claimed inequality.

The improvement on the diamagnetic inequality is not the whole story. We suspect that the Loss-Yau zero modes are the optimizers.

$$\psi = \frac{1 + i\sigma \cdot x}{(1 + |x|^2)^{3/2}} \phi, \phi \text{ a constant spinor}$$

$$|\psi|^{1/2} = (1 + |x|^2)^{-1/2}$$

is an optimizer for the Sobolev inequality

By the way: A straightforward computation shows that

$$\|B_{LY}\|_{3/2} = 4S_3$$

which is still off by a factor of 2 !!

Lemma

For any $\psi \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{C}^2)$ and any $\varepsilon > 0$, the function $|\psi|_\varepsilon^{1/2}$ is weakly differentiable with $\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon^{1/2} \in L^2(\mathbb{R}^3)$ and one has almost everywhere and in the sense of L^1 ,

$$\left| \nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon^{1/2} \right|^2 = \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Re} \left\langle \nabla \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, \nabla \psi \right\rangle - \frac{1}{4} \left(2|\psi|_\varepsilon^{-1} |\nabla \psi|^2 - 3 \frac{|\psi|^2}{|\psi|_\varepsilon^3} |\nabla |\psi||^2 \right). \quad (5)$$

The proof is a straightforward computation with Sobolev functions

$$\begin{aligned}
& \left| \nabla |\psi|_\varepsilon^{1/2} \right|^2 = \\
& \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Re} \left\langle (\nabla - i\mathbf{A}) \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, (\nabla - i\mathbf{A}) \psi \right\rangle \\
& - \frac{1}{4|\psi|_\varepsilon} \left(2 |(\nabla - i\mathbf{A}) \psi|^2 - 3 \frac{|\psi|^2}{|\psi|_\varepsilon^2} |\nabla |\psi||^2 \right) \\
& = \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Re} \left\langle (\nabla - i\mathbf{A}) \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, (\nabla - i\mathbf{A}) \psi \right\rangle \\
& - \frac{1}{4|\psi|_\varepsilon} \left(2 |(\nabla - i\mathbf{A}) \psi|^2 - 3 |\nabla |\psi||^2 \right) - \frac{3\varepsilon^2}{4|\psi|_\varepsilon^3} |\nabla |\psi||^2 .
\end{aligned}$$

By Lemma 3

$$2|(\nabla - iA)\psi|^2 - 3|\nabla|\psi||^2 \geq 0$$

and hence

$$|\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon^{1/2}|^2 \leq \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Re} \left\langle (\nabla - iA) \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, (\nabla - iA)\psi \right\rangle$$

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\nabla|\psi|_\varepsilon^{1/2}|^2 dx &\leq \frac{1}{2} \operatorname{Re} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \left\langle (\nabla - iA) \frac{\psi}{|\psi|_\varepsilon}, (\nabla - iA)\psi \right\rangle dx \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} B(x) \cdot \frac{\langle \psi, \sigma \psi \rangle}{|\psi|_\varepsilon} dx \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |B(x)| \frac{|\psi|^2}{|\psi|_\varepsilon} dx \end{aligned}$$

Letting $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \left| \nabla |\psi|^{1/2} \right|^2 dx \leq \frac{1}{2} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |B(x)| |\psi| dx \quad (\star)$$

$$S_3 \|\psi\|_3 \leq \frac{1}{2} \|B\|_{3/2} \|\psi\|_3$$

yields the result

Is this result optimal?

$$\psi = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}r^{3/2}} \begin{pmatrix} \sqrt{r+z} \\ \frac{x+iy}{\sqrt{r+z}} \end{pmatrix},$$

$$\sigma \cdot \vec{x}\psi = r\psi$$

and

$$|\psi|^2 = \frac{1}{r^2}.$$

Now consider the monopole A -field

$$A = g \frac{(-y, x, 0)}{r(r+z)}$$

$$\text{curl}A = g \frac{\vec{x}}{r^3}.$$

We also have that

$$\sigma \cdot A\psi = ig \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}r^{5/2}} \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{r-z}{\sqrt{r+z}} \\ \frac{x+iy}{\sqrt{r+z}} \end{pmatrix}, \quad (-i)\sigma \cdot \nabla\psi = i \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}r^{5/2}} \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{r-z}{\sqrt{r+z}} \\ \frac{x+iy}{\sqrt{r+z}} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\sigma \cdot [(-i\nabla) - A]\psi = 0$$

if we choose $g = \frac{1}{2}$

$$|\nabla|\psi|^{1/2}|^2 = \frac{1}{4} \frac{1}{|x|^3}$$

$$\frac{1}{2} \frac{\langle \psi, B \cdot \sigma \psi \rangle}{|\psi|} = \frac{1}{4} \frac{1}{|x|^3}$$

This 'saturates' (\star).

Euler-Lagrange equation for the Sobolev constant

$$-\Delta f - f^5 = 0$$

Regular solution up to translation

$$f_r(x) = 3^{1/4} \left(\frac{1}{\lambda} + \lambda x^2 \right)^{-1/2}$$

Singular solution up to translation

$$f_s(x) = \frac{1}{4} |x|^{-1/2}$$

The function $|x|^{-1/2}$ is 'optimizer' for Hardy's inequality

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\nabla f(x)|^2 dx \geq \frac{1}{4} \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \frac{|f(x)|^2}{|x|^2} dx$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\nabla f(x)|^2 dx - \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} V(x) f(x)^2 dx \\
& \geq \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\nabla f^*(x)|^2 dx - \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} V^*(x) f^*(x)^2 dx \\
& \geq \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\nabla f^*(x)|^2 dx - \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \frac{|f^*(x)|^2}{|x|^2} dx \sup_x \{|x|^2 V^*(x)\}
\end{aligned}$$

A necessary condition for the existence of a negative bound state is

$$|\mathbb{S}^3|^{-2/3} \|V\|_{w,3/2} = \sup_x \{|x|^2 V^*(x)\} > \frac{1}{4}$$

Theorem

Let $B \in L_w^{3/2}(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{R}^3)$ be a magnetic field, i.e., $\operatorname{div} B = 0$. If (1) has a weak solution $0 \neq \psi \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{C}^2)$, then

$$\|B\|_{w,3/2} \geq \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{4\pi}{3} \right)^{2/3}$$

or, equivalently,

$$\sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}^3} |x|^2 |B|^*(x) \geq \frac{1}{2}. \quad (6)$$

The monopole field $\frac{1}{2} \frac{x}{|x|^3}$ is an optimizer

Theorem

Assume that $\lambda \in L^3(\mathbb{R}^3)$ is a real function. If the equation

$$-i\sigma \cdot \nabla \psi = 3\lambda(x)\psi$$

has a weak solution $0 \neq \psi \in L^p(\mathbb{R}^3; \mathbb{C}^2)$ for some $3/2 < p < \infty$, then

$$\frac{1}{4}|\mathbb{S}^3|^{\frac{2}{3}} \leq \left[\int |\lambda(x)|^3 dx \right]^{2/3}. \quad (7)$$

There is equality in (7) if

$$\lambda(x) = \frac{1}{1+x^2},$$

in which case (2) is a solution.

$$-i\sigma \cdot \nabla\psi = 3\lambda(x)\psi ,$$

we consider again the operator

$$\Pi(\beta \otimes \psi)_j = \beta_j\psi - \frac{1}{3}\sigma_j\sigma \cdot \beta\psi$$

but proceed in a slightly different manner by considering

$$\Pi(\partial_j - i\lambda(x)\sigma_j)\phi = (\partial_j - i\lambda(x)\sigma_j)\phi - \frac{1}{3}\sigma_j\sigma \cdot (\nabla - i\lambda(x)\sigma)\phi .$$

Lemma

Let $\psi \in L^p(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{C}^2)$, $p > 3/2$ satisfy $-i\sigma \cdot \nabla\psi = 3\lambda(x)\psi$. Then $\psi \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^3 : \mathbb{C}^2)$, and $|\psi| \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^3)$ as well and moreover, almost everywhere in \mathbb{R}^3 ,

$$3|\nabla|\psi||^2 \leq 2|[\nabla - i\lambda(x)\sigma]\psi|^2 . \quad (8)$$

With similar computations as before we find

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \left| \nabla |\psi|^{1/2} \right|^2 dx \leq 3 \int_{\mathbb{R}^3} \lambda^2 |\psi| dx .$$

$$S_3 \leq 3 \left(\int_{\mathbb{R}^3} |\lambda|^3 dx \right)^{2/3}$$

$$\lambda(x) = \frac{1}{1 + |x|^2}$$

saturates this inequality and with

$$\psi = \frac{1 + i\sigma \cdot x}{(1 + |x|^2)^{3/2}} \phi$$

we find

$$-i\sigma \cdot \nabla \psi = \frac{3}{1 + |x|^2} \psi .$$

The results for the zero modes in magnetic fields hold in any odd dimension.

In the case where the potential is a scalar function the results hold in all dimension ≥ 2 .

If we assume that $\lambda(x) > 0$ and the solution ϕ smooth, the sharp estimate follows from Hijazi's inequality:

Dirac operator D on \mathbb{S}^d (metric g)

$$g_u = e^{2u} g, D_u \psi_u = \left(e^{-\frac{d+1}{2}u} D e^{\frac{d-1}{2}u} \psi \right)_u$$

Hijazi (1991)

$$\lambda_1(D_u)^2 \geq \frac{d}{4(d-1)} \lambda_1(L_u),$$

$$L_u = e^{-\frac{(d+2)}{2}u} L e^{\frac{(d-2)}{2}u}.$$

L conformal Laplacian on \mathbb{S}^d

THANK YOU